



**Note from Education Program Administrator: the following study guide was presented by the filmmaker.*

Those Who Remain

TEACHERS' GUIDE

Introduction

In today's modern world, which is increasingly materialistic and technologically oriented, we sometimes forget to stop and appreciate the smaller things in life that have valuable lessons to teach us.

As teachers, we have an immense repertoire of activities at our disposal, which we can use as a springboard to get our students to:

- Pose themselves questions of a philosophical nature and reflect on life by engaging in dialogue with others
- Learn to analyze social and political issues
- Develop their critical thought skills
- Identify values that are worth living or dying for

This Teachers' Guide has been compiled at the initiative of the production company **La Sombra del Guayabo** to assist teachers aiming to give their students a comprehensive education. It takes the stories of the characters portrayed in the feature-length documentary **Those Who Remain** as a starting point for a series of activities and strategies intended to trigger reflection and help students develop their critical thought processes as part of an all-round learning experience.

The idea is to encourage students to engage in dialogue, based on what they have seen in **Those Who Remain**. The material and resources provided are aimed at high school and college students, although the dialogue plans can be adapted to younger groups if so desired.

Methodology

The methodology we are proposing is the Community of Inquiry¹ approach, which is:

“A project whose main objective is to create a philosophical community of inquiry that helps students reason better and think for themselves, and that provides them with the tools they need to deal with real-life situations.”²

Mathew Lipman, the author of this approach, has written several novels³ geared toward triggering dialogue within a Community of Inquiry. In addition to novels, we believe the modern language of cinema is another appropriate medium for raising questions of a philosophical nature in today’s society. This is especially true in the case of a documentary such as **Those Who Remain**, whose characters, stories and images arouse feelings and thoughts propitious to reflection and dialogue.

There are four phases to creating a Community of Inquiry in the classroom:

1. Trigger activity
2. Formulation of questions
3. DIALOGUE on the questions posed
4. Conclusions

There are no specific guidelines for the amount of time that should be devoted to each phase, except for trigger activity, which is the documentary in this case and which lasts 96 minutes. The other phases can be conducted in one or a series of classes, depending on the pace, interests and purposes of each group or subject area.

1. Trigger Activity

Watch **Those Who Remain**, preferably in one sitting.

2. Questions

This is a very important phase because this is when your students are required to come up with the questions around which the discussion will revolve. This can be done as a class, in pairs or in groups of three. For example, you could ask your students to “discuss the questions that come to your mind after watching **Those Who Remain** with the person sitting beside you.”

Once the students have decided on their questions, the class will vote on which one they want to begin the discussion with. We suggest you write all the questions on the blackboard so everyone can see them.

¹ A concept conceived by M. Lipman and Ann M. Sharp.

² De la Garza Teresa, working paper, 2008.

³ See Bibliography for the novels written by M. Lipman and Ann Sharp, each of which comes with its own manual.

The teacher should ensure that the questions chosen are of a philosophical nature, i.e. that they are open-ended questions that trigger debate. For example, a suitable question would be “What are some of the reasons people emigrate?” By the same token, it is advisable to avoid single-answer questions like “What were the names of the characters?”

3. Dialogue

We recommend you ask your students to sit in a one- or two-tiered circle, depending on the space available and the number of participants. This is so the students can see each others’ faces when they are conversing, thereby creating the sensation of a community (that includes the teacher).

So that everyone has a chance to speak and be heard, ask your students not to interrupt and to raise their hand if they have a comment to make.

Beginning with the question that won the initial vote, the task of the teacher is to lead the students into a debate. Should you require further guidance the dialogue plans in this Guide contain sample questions and exercises that can be used to complement this phase. At the end of the guide, you will also find an appendix of points for reflection that you can put to your students. The teacher should act as a mediator, guiding students back to the issue being debated when they get sidetracked and ensuring that the dialogue flows, is relevant and contributes to the overall learning experience.

4. Conclusions

Before the time allocated to the dialogue phase is up, it is important that the teacher ask the group to reach a few general conclusions. You can wrap the session up at this point or agree on a day and time for further debate. Even if you decide to continue, we recommend you sum up that day’s discussion and highlight the most important points made.

General Recommendations

Most of the subjects addressed by a Community of Inquiry are ones **we almost never discuss**. However, the objective is not to pass on or teach theoretical concepts; what we are seeking to create is a forum where students can freely discuss the thoughts and feelings that watching **Those Who Remain** provokes and ideally make a connection between these and their own lives. This should be an opportunity for students to discover how they think and feel about certain issues and what the views and feelings of other members of the Community of Inquiry are with regard to the same issues.

Discussion should revolve around what the stories and characters portrayed in the documentary mean to us, what place they hold in our hearts. This will necessarily lead us into diverse areas of knowledge, such as nature, ethics, culture, society, politics, etc. Once these subjects have been explored in depth, they can be tied in with other subject areas.

When we watch a film, particularly one like **Those Who Remain**, we usually experience a mixture of thoughts and emotions.

- Remember that the best introduction to philosophy is a sense of amazement and wonder. **If we put answers in our students' mouths, we are depriving them of the search, of the chance to feel this sense of awe. In short, we are putting an end to dialogue.**
- **The teacher should respect the students' opinions and refrain from leading the discussion in the direction he wants it to go or eliciting the answers he wants to hear.** All students should be given the chance to freely express themselves and be heard. **This is why the students should speak first.**
- The dialogue plans we have provided are intended to help with this process, but the questions should always come from the students themselves and be **written down word for word as the students express them.**

Dialogue Plans

Below you will find a series of dialogue plans with questions and exercises designed to trigger reflection on three central themes and help the teacher structure group sessions within the Community of Inquiry. The suggestions we offer can be complemented by the personal experience of the teacher, depending on the group and specific context.

Central Theme No. 1: Emigration

Emigration is an age-old social phenomenon that has evolved into a survival strategy. On the one hand, it tears families and communities apart, with the associated social repercussions, but on the other, it offers these same families and communities the economic opportunities their survival ultimately depends on.

Dialogue Plan

1. What is emigration?
2. Who emigrates?
3. Do birds emigrate for the same reasons humans beings do?
4. Why and when do people emigrate?
5. Is emigration a phenomenon or a problem?

Exercise 1

List the reasons people emigrate and explain them. Divide your reasons and explanations into two columns. (Clarify that we give a reason to *justify our actions* and an explanation to *describe how something happened*).

Sample questions:

- Do you remember any of the reasons the characters in **Those Who Remain** emigrated?
- How would you explain the phenomenon of emigration?

Exercise 2

Based on the characters in the film, describe how emigration affects:

- Couples
- The family
- The community

Once the students have completed this task, the teacher should guide them toward a more in-depth discussion of each category.

Central Theme No. 2: The Role Education Plays as a Public Asset in the Phenomenon of Emigration

Dialogue Plan

- Is education a right or a public asset?
- Does everyone enjoy equal higher education opportunities?
- Why did the veterinary not emigrate?
- Is Gerardo right when he says he has to emigrate because he didn't finish school?
- Why do you think his daughters' education is so important to Yaremi's father?

Exercise 1

- Make a list of the benefits and disadvantages of high school and college education.
- Separate the benefits and disadvantages of education for the individual from the benefits and disadvantages for society.

Exercise 2

- Make a list of what happens when less than 50% of young people in a given country have access to high school or college education.

Central Theme No. 3: Values

Values are objects of our approval or disapproval. For example, if someone disapproves of students throwing paper planes in class or approves of teamwork, these objects of their approval or disapproval are values. However, even if I enjoy doing something, I can still ask myself if it is really worthwhile.

If values are things we are willing to *live* or *die* for, we must identify them, be able to think, reflect and inquire about them. The judgment calls we make as a result will be more reliable and more responsible than those made in the absence of such reflection.⁴

Dialogue Plan

- Can emigration be a good thing and a bad thing at the same time?
- What does the fact that Yaremi doesn't want her father to leave again reveal to you?
- Does the same thing apply to another character in the film? Why?
- Why does Maricela's family emigrate, even though they are afraid to?
- Can it still be worth doing something, even if it makes you sad or frightens you? Why?

Exercise 1

This exercise can be done in groups of three or four, followed by a class discussion.

- Identify and describe the values that appear **Those Who Remain**.
- Look for examples of each of these values in your own lives.

Appendix

The questions listed below can be introduced by the teacher during the dialogue phase to help students develop their critical thought skills.⁵

Skill	Question
Offer points of view	What do you think about this? Does anyone have a different point of view?
Offer alternatives	What other way could this be viewed? Can you think of another way of looking at it, even if it's different to your own point of view?
Clarify	Can you explain a bit more clearly what you're trying to say? Can anyone clarify what she's saying?
Rephrase	Can you tell me the same thing, but in different words?
Infer	Based on what you're saying, do you think it implies...?
Define	Based on what we've discussed, can anyone give me a

⁴ Matthew Lipman et al., *Investigación Filosófica. Manual del profesoro*, Institute for the Advancement of Philosophy for Children. Ediciones de la Torre, proyecto didáctico, Quirón España.

⁵ List courtesy of Dr. Eugenio Echeverría from the Latin American Center of Philosophy for Children (CELAFIN).

	definition of...? Can you tell me what you understand by
Detect assumptions	Are you assuming that...?
Give reasons	Why do you think that? Why do think that's acceptable?
Project personal ideals	Would you always like to be like that? How would you like to be?
Project world ideals	Would you like to live in a world that was ...?
Develop empathy	How would you feel if you were in that person's place?
Offer examples	Can anyone give me an example of what he's saying?
Consider means and ends	To achieve that, would it be advisable to...? Do you think that's the best way of going about it?
Foresee consequences	If that happened, what else could happen? If you say that, what is the other person going to think?
Use analogies	How is one character similar to another? How are they different?
Offer counter-examples	Can anyone give me an example that contradicts what she's saying?

Other helpful questions:⁶

How to detect what we are assuming when we voice an opinion:

- What are you assuming when you say that ...?
- Could someone assume that ...?

Asking for reasons or explaining facts:

- What reasons do you have for saying that?
- Do you agree with his reasons for saying that...?
- Can anyone think of another reason for saying that ...?
- Is there any way of proving that what you're saying is true?
- On what criteria are you basing your opinion?

Detect implications and consequences:

- What does what you're saying imply?
- If we accept what you're saying, what would be the consequences?
- Do you think your comment is relevant to the subject we're discussing?
- Do you think we're prepared to assume the consequences of ...?

Summarize the inquiry process:

- Based on everything we've said, can we suggest an answer to the question we initially posed?
- Can anyone summarize the most relevant points of our discussion?

⁶ Courtesy of Dr. Eugenio Echeverría, CELAFIN.

- Can we say we've answered the question we initially asked? If so, why? If not, why?
- What are you thinking?
- How do you feel?

Teachers' Guide compiled by Centro Eduacional Tanesque A.C.
info@tanesque.edu.mx